OFFPRINT

MODERN GREEK STUDIES YEARBOOK

A PUBLICATION OF MEDITERRANEAN, SLAVIC
AND
EASTERN ORTHODOX STUDIES

UNIVERSITY OF MINNESOTA
Minneapolis, Minnesota

Volume 28/29, 2012/2013

Sibel Zandi-Sayek, *Ottoman Izmir: The Rise of a Cosmopolitan Port, 1840–1880* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2012), xvii + 273 pp.

A specialist in architecture, city planning, and urban studies, with interests in cultural exchange and art history, Sibel Zandi-Sayek has written an interesting book on the city of Izmir (Smyrna), situated on the west coast of Asia Minor. During the period examined in *Ottoman Izmir: The Rise of a Cosmopolitan Port, 1840–1880*, Smyrna underwent unprecedented changes, because of internal reforms in the policy of the Ottoman sultans and developments in international relations concerning trade transportation methods. As a result, "the total volume of trade increased over fourfold, but trade patterns and consumption habits changed significantly as the empire participated more deeply in a global economy centered on Europe, especially Britain" (24). Located at the end of the land caravan/railway trade routes from and to the East, Smyrna welcomed vessels and, in the period under investigation, steamships with international destinations. Merchants, bankers, seasonal workers, sailors, migrants (Muslims, Christians, Armenians, Jews) from the hinterland, Greeks from the Aegean islands and the new Greek state, and foreigners (Venetians until the end of the eighteenth century, French, English, Dutch, and Jews, the so-called Levantines) contributed to the transformation of the city into a real metropolis (O. J. Schmitt, *Levantiner: Lebenswelten und Identitäten einer ethnokonfessionellen Gruppe im Osmanischen Reich im "langen 19. Jahrhundert"* [2005]). In 1999, Daniel Goffman entitled his article as follows: "Izmir: From Village to Colonial Port City" (in E. Eldem, D. Goffman, and B. Masters, *The Ottoman City between East and West: Aleppo, Izmir, and Istanbul* [1999]). In her *Ottoman Izmir*, Zandi-Sayek explores the dynamics of urban transformation in a city at the nexus of nineteenth-century global exchange, a transformation which, in fact, had begun in the eighteenth century, within the framework of the so-called rivalry among the Western European commercial powers in the eastern Mediterranean. It is during the time under consideration that the population of the city—despite large variations—increased "at least twofold, if not three- or fourfold, . . . evidently due to immigration, rather than natural growth alone" (24). By 1845, over twenty new quarters had emerged in the northern side of the city to accommodate Greeks,

Maltese, and other immigrants (map I.3). Likewise, beginning in the 1880s, Muslim refugees from the Balkans set up new quarters at the southern slopes of Kadifekale (map 1.4). The new buildings (the governor's palace [*konak*], U-shaped military barracks, maneuver grounds, and a massive prison [map 1.6 (a)-(b), fig. 1.13-14]), which housed the modernized imperial bureaucracy for overseeing public order and security, were erected in this southern part. The formal square, enlarged and reorganized as part of Izmir's monumental quay, promoted Ottoman authority.

The book, organized in an instructive introduction, four chapters, and an epilogue, is the fruit of long and thorough research that utilized a variety of sources: Ottoman and European (French, British, American) archives; the *Salname* records of the province of Aydın; the Ottoman, English, and French press published in the Ottoman Empire and in the city of Smyrna in particular; and a rich scholarly literature (235-60). More than sixty maps and figures frame her work and support her arguments. The initial maps 1-3 predispose the reader to a book concentrating on the space and the topographic development of the multifaceted city. But Zandi-Sayek uses "urban space and spatial practices as a lens to investigate the dynamic nature of identity and belonging in a rapidly modernizing and centralizing, multinational and multireligious state" (6). She gives us the profile of a city unaccustomed to agitation, according to French parliamentarian Charles Rolland (1852), "transformed into an arena of debates and experiences" (2): debates concerning the "Defining Citizenship" (chapter 1, 47-74), "Ordering the Streets" (chapter 2, 75-114), "Shaping the Waterfront" (chapter 3, 115-50), and "Performing Community" (chapter 4, 151-86). Throughout her vivid narration, the author offers a reconfiguring of the boundaries of social power and authority, the art of negotiating the interests of the city's multiethnic/multireligious inhabitants and its governors, who included not only Ottomans but also the rich "foreigners," who continued to immigrate in successive waves. During the forty years after the Anglo-Ottoman commercial treaty of 1838, Smyrna was transformed, within global networks of exchange and, simultaneously, within the expansion of Ottoman state bureaucracy, into a modern statecraft in its efforts to check European expansionist ambitions, when

> the *Tanzimat* regime introduced a mixed commercial court (ticaret miclici), presided over by a Muslim judge and comprising non-Muslim Ottoman and foreign panel member . . . for trying cases between Ottoman and foreign subjects, but also bolstered the distinction between these categories, casting them as mutually exclusive. The 1869 Ottoman Nationality Law (Tabiyet-i Osmaniye Kanunu) further reinforced this divide, categorically denying property and inheritance rights to Ottoman subjects acquiring foreign naturalization (42-43).

In the first chapter, "Defining Citizenship: Property, Taxation, and Sovereignty," Zandi-Sayek gives a detailed panorama of the complex array of judicial spheres and jurisdictions of the Ottoman system (according to Islamic law, the ethnoreligious variations of the Ottoman subjects, and the status of the foreign consuls), and its steady transformation during the *Tanzimat* period. Smyrniots bought and sold property frequently. Buildings and stores provided rental income and had a liquidity that was comparable to cash. The analysis of the steady transformation of the property and tax systems during this era reveals not only the changes in the legal system, but also the dynamic relationship between property and "urban citizenship"; a citizenship seen in an anthropological and social context, and not only as the exclusive domain of

nation-state belonging. Especially in Smyrna, the complicated relations among the "*protégés*" subjects of the West European consuls, deriving from the complex *capitulations* status, had led not only to hybrid legal situations but also to negotiated formal and informal identities. Ownership rights among foreigners—legally not permitted but de facto existing because of the volatility of the system—"became a fundamental arena for constructing and negotiating the boundaries of modern citizenship" (66). The need for the new cadastral bureau and the office for the registry of freehold land facilitated the formation of a commission for the identification of the inhabitants' property and the creation of a new city map by the Italian engineer Luigi Storari (map 2), with the names of the streets and the topographical numbers of buildings. The result was a new way of entry into the city's political sphere, and of defining foreign subjects' rights to the city, distinct from national and religious origins.

"Fires, Epidemics and Ruffians" (78) a section of chapter 2, examines mainly public space and urban governance. The fires (1834 and 1841, among others) gave impetus to the modernization process, especially in the so-called *Franco-mahalle* (Western European quarter), where Greek immigrants were also established. New large churches (figs. 2.1-2, 2.3), hospitals (French, Dutch, Greek, et al.), and consul houses erected in the new neighborhoods which had been rebuilt in a more rectangular modern form (map 2.1a-b), marked the wealth of their inhabitants. At the same time, the widening of the streets (fig. 2.9), the creation of new commercial areas (fig. 2.10-11), the care of pavements, the unimpeded use of free space among stores and buildings with a regulated façade (fig. 2.4), the relocation of the Catholic, Protestant (map 2.2), and Greek cemeteries, and the controversies concerning street lighting (fig. 2.5, map 2.3, and pages 92-94, change from portable kerosene lamps to gas lighting), defined more clearly the differences between the northern and the southern sides of the city. Since part of the costs for these changes was incurred by the members of the municipal districts, the northern part of the city changed visibly in a modern way, in contrast to the Muslim-Jewish part of the south, where only the administrative buildings illustrated the new order. Its inhabitants continued to work and live in the shadow of the rich, modern, westernized "European" northern district, with the consequent dichotomies mirrored in the variety of urban citizenships. These evolutions became more than visible to the Ottoman authorities, who, in the framework of the administrative reformation, tried to establish a new legitimacy concerning municipal organization and the involvement or not of the foreigners. And who were the "foreigners" in a city where many Western Europeans had been established for decades, and whose families and businesses contributed to the prosperity of the city? These are questions that Zandi-Sayek examines thoroughly in this chapter (especially 93-101).

The indisputable transformation of the city was evident in "Shaping the Waterfront" (chapter 3), a theme well investigated until now by Greek scholars, such as Alexandra Karadimou-Yerolympos and Vilma Hastaoglu-Martinidis (A. Karadimou-Yerolympos, "Η πόλη-λιμάνι της Σμύρνης στο τέλος της Οθωμανικής Αυτοκρατορίας: Μορφές χωρικής οργάνωσης και ελληνική παρουσία," in *Η πόλη στους νεότερους χρόνους: Μεσογειακές και Βαλκανικές όψεις (19ος–20ός αι.), Πρακτικά Β′ διεθνούς συνεδρίου* [2000]; and V. Hastaoglu-Martinidis, "The Cartography of Harbor Construction in Eastern Mediterranean Cities: Technical and Urban Modernization in the Late Nineteenth Century," in B. Kolluoğlu and M. Toksöz, eds., *Cities of the Mediterranean: From the Ottomans to the Present Day* [2010]), and

by Zandi-Sayek ("Struggles over the Shore: Building the Quay of Izmir, 1867–1875," *City and Society* 12, no. 1 [2000]: 55-78). The main objective of this chapter is the analysis not only of the topographical and mechanical problems and obstacles (which is made briefly and comprehensively with the aid of fig. 3.1-14, map 3.1-5), but also of those that provoked disputes between groups of inhabitants who had rights to the water and piers and those who could profit from the new transformation. Business interests, ethnic or professional affiliations, ideological alliances and differences emerged during the long debates and controversies, while the building of the new grand quay effected an economic and social realignment. This discussion is presented in the sections, "Debating the Public Good" (126-31), "Shaping the Shore" (132-40), and "Sites of Friction" (140-49).

The fourth and last chapter, titled "Performing Community: Rituals and Identity," is the quintessence of the arguments developed in the previous pages. Taking as a starting-point the procession (map 4.1) of Corpus Christi on 27 May 1842—a great ceremony for the first time organized in a magnificent ritual-spectacle by Catholic archbishop Antonio Mussabini—the author tries to illustrate the tangible ideologies and worldviews in the mid-nineteenth century city-port. Mussabini managed to bring together the officials of the various Catholic European powers, assigned them distinguishing roles in the procession, fully aware of the controversial economic and political interests of the various countries, and delivered a lavish pageant, "Performing a Transnational Catholic Community" (160-69). This event garnered support from European countries and "provided Izmir's Latin Catholics international recognition, while official Ottoman presence confirmed the status that local Catholics were claiming for themselves as equal participants in the reformed empire free to practice their religion." Furthermore, the procession "asserted the place of Izmir's Catholics in relation to the recognized ethno-religious structure of the city, particularly the Greek Orthodox community that constituted the majority of its Christian population" (169). Religious feasts, such as Greek Orthodox Easter (fig. 4.1, 6, 7, 3: with fireworks in the courtyard of St. Fotini), carnival rituals (fig. 4.4), or the Muslim Ramadan provided opportunities for establishing common ground. The celebration of national holidays with so many representatives of new and old European nation-states have often provided opportunities for communication but also for expression of diversity.

Some concluding remarks are in order. The last chapter and the epilogue attempt to give a pluralist view of the city, with its communal diversities and self-definitions. This pluralist approach, however, is in a way incomplete. Since the author did not use the admittedly rich Greek and Armenian literature and press of the Smyrniot society, the reader cannot fully see the pluralism of the multilateral, flourishing Christian community of the north. Furthermore, the book's subtitle, "The Rise of a Cosmopolitan Port," can be in a way problematic. After I finished reading the book, I was left with the same question as when I had finished my own research on European and, especially, Greek and Greek-Armenian literature on the subject. Was Smyrna at that time a truly cosmopolitan city, or, rather, a city divided in two parts with distinct neighborhoods (*mahalle*), two municipal districts (map 2.4)? It was in the *Franco-mahalle* that the real commercial, economic, and cultural metropolis developed. Only in this quarter can one really speak about a cosmopolitan part of the city, with western-oriented inhabitants, especially non-Muslims—Catholics, Protestants, Greek Orthodox, and Armenians. In this reviewer's opinion, Smyrna was not a truly cosmopolitan city, where the art of communication was evident in all walks of

daily life, thereby creating a melting pot. Rather, communication between the Christians of the northern and the Muslims of the southern part was present in the morning bazaars, in the activities, and in communications with the Ottoman administrative authorities. But it was not present in social life per se. The *Ottoman Izmir* was really a *gâvur İzmir* (Smyrna of the infidels =non Muslims).

These limitations, however, do not diminish the contribution of Zandi-Sayek to the study of Smyrna. On the contrary, *Ottoman Izmir* should generate fruitful scholarly dialogue.

Olga Katsiardi-Hering
National and Kapodistrian University of Athens

The *Modern Greek Studies Yearbook* is published by the Modern Greek Studies Program at the University of Minnesota. The price for volume 28/29 is $60.00. Checks should be made payable to the *Modern Greek Studies Yearbook*, and sent to:

Modern Greek Studies
325 Social Sciences Building
University of Minnesota
267–19th Avenue South
Minneapolis, MN 55455
Telephone: (612) 624-4526
FAX: (612) 626-2242
E-mail: mgsp@umn.edu

The main objective of the *Modern Greek Studies Yearbook* is the dissemination of scholarly information in the field of modern Greek studies. The field is broadly defined to include the social sciences and the humanities, indeed any body of knowledge that touches on the modern Greek experience. Topics dealing with earlier periods, the Byzantine and even the Classical, will be considered provided they relate, in some way, to aspects of later Greek history and culture. Geographically, the field extends to any place where modern Hellenism flourished and made significant contributions, whether in the "Helladic space" proper or in the *Diaspora*. More importantly, in comparative and contextual terms, the Mediterranean basin and Europe fall within the province of the *Yearbook*'s objectives. Special attention will be paid to subjects dealing with Greek-Slavic relations and Eastern Orthodox history and culture in general.

Copyright © 2013
Modern Greek Studies
University of Minnesota
All rights reserved
ISSN 0884-8432

The University of Minnesota is an equal-opportunity employer.
Printed in the United States of America on acid-free paper