

**KNOWLEDGE, NATION, AND THE CURRICULUM:
OTTOMAN ARMENIAN EDUCATION (1853 - 1915)**

by

Pamela J. Young

A dissertation submitted in partial fulfillment
of the requirements for the degree of
Doctor of Philosophy
(Education)
The University of Michigan
2001

Doctoral Committee:

Professor Teshome G. Wagaw, Chair
Associate Professor Kevork B. Bardakjian
Associate Professor Fatma Muge Göçek
Assistant Professor Jana Nidiffer

TABLE OF CONTENTS

DEDICATION.....	ii
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS	iii
TABLE OF CONTENTS.....	vi
LIST OF APPENDICES.....	x
LIST OF TABLES	xi
LIST OF FIGURES	xii
LIST OF ILLUSTRATIONS	xiii
PLACE NAMES AND TRANSLITERATIONS.....	xiv
MAP.....	xv
CHAPTER 1: INTRODUCTION.....	1
Sources	6
Chapter overview	8
CHAPTER 2: THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK	12
Introduction	12
Framing nation and nationalism.....	13
Primordialists and Perennialism.....	13
Constructivists.....	14
Ethno-symbolic	17
Defining state and nation.....	20
Education and identity.....	22
Philosophical Framework of the Educational System.....	23
Policy Formation	25
Curricular Content.....	27
Formal Curriculum.....	28
Educational Planners, decision makers and teachers	29
Informal Education.....	30
Hidden Curriculum.....	32
Resources	33

Learners	35
Conclusion.....	36
CHAPTER 3: HISTORICAL CONTEXTUALIZATION OF THE OTTOMAN EMPIRE AND ITS CHRISTIAN MINORITIES	38
Introduction	38
Historical Roots and the Crossing Paths of the Ottomans and the Armenians	39
The division of Armenia: Persian, Russian and Ottoman rule.....	43
Millet System and Tanzimat Reforms.....	48
Educational Reforms	50
The Ottoman Greeks	52
Ottoman Armenians	55
Religious and communal hierarchy.....	56
Language	60
Religious Differences	63
Family and gender roles	67
Transforming Empire	69
The development of the Armenian national movement	70
Rise of the Young Turks	72
Conclusion.....	75
CHAPTER 4: THE FOUNDATION AND STRUCTURE OF THE OTTOMAN ARMENIAN EDUCATIONAL SYSTEM: FROM CENTER TO PERIPHERY	76
Introduction	76
Young Armenian Intellectuals.....	76
National Education Council and the Armenian Constitution.....	78
Educational Council membership	81
Centralization of authority.....	83
Initial responsibilities	84
Philosophy of Education	87
Educating women	90
Education in Constantinople	93
Provincial education	94
A case study of growth in provincial education:	
Erzerum	99
Educational Life in the City of Erzerum	100
Schools sponsored by benevolent societies.....	105
Conclusion.....	109

CHAPTER 5: THE CREATION OF EDUCATIONAL POLICIES	111
Introduction	111
School Buildings	111
School Funding and Finances.....	115
Admissions policies	119
Student Backgrounds.....	121
Conclusion.....	125
CHAPTER 6: GUIDING THE CURRICULUM: THE ROLE OF EDUCATIONAL LEADERS AND TEACHERS	126
Introduction	126
Benefactors.....	127
Trustees and Management Committees	130
School Directors.....	134
Teachers	147
Responsibilities	148
Teacher training.....	148
Certification.....	152
Teachers and the construction of identity at Getronagan and Sanasarian	156
Conclusion.....	165
CHAPTER 7: FORMAL CLASSES AND INFORMAL LEARNING EXPERIENCES	167
Introduction	167
The school day.....	168
Secondary School Curriculum.....	171
Humanities and Social Science Classes	172
Religion, Art & Music Classes.....	175
German and French influences in the class structure	177
Professional knowledge - trade and crafts.....	181
Science and mathematics classes	182
Curricular guidelines for girls' schools.....	183
Curricular Reforms.....	185
Informal Learning.....	188
Libraries and museums.....	189
Holidays, school assemblies, and special events.....	191
School Trips	193
Theater.....	197
Music and sports.....	199
Conclusion.....	202

CHAPTER 8: FROM CURRICULAR CONTENT AND TEACHING MATERIALS TO IDENTITY DEVELOPMENT.....	204
Introduction	204
Regulating Textbooks	205
Textbook Format and Content.....	208
Armenian Language and History Textbooks.....	209
Ancient History	210
Nature	211
Diaspora	212
Cultural History of the Ottoman Armenians	214
Religion	217
Modern History	218
Transnational Knowledge.....	219
History	221
Languages.....	224
Ottoman History & Language	227
Science & Mathematics.....	229
Religion, Philosophy and Moral Values.....	231
Examinations.....	236
Diplomas	238
Conclusion.....	239
CHAPTER 9: FROM STUDENT ORGANIZATION AND ACTIVISM TO EXPRESSIONS OF NATIONAL IDENTITY	240
Introduction	240
School Life	241
Prayer.....	241
Dress.....	242
Behavior and Activism.....	244
Student writings.....	248
Graduates.....	252
A Lone Woman	261
Conclusion.....	263
CHAPTER 10: CONCLUSION.....	265
APPENDICES	268
BIBLIOGRAPHY	280

LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendices

A.	Getronagan Planned Curriculum 1886.....	269
B.	Getronagan Revised Curriculum: 1897-1915.....	270
C.	School Graduation Certificates.....	273
D.	1913 School Graduation Certificate.....	274
E.	Getronagan Grade Report.....	275
F.	Getronagan Graduation Certificate the list.....	276
G.	Sanasarian Grade Report and Graduation Certificate	277
H.	Sanasarian Graduation Program – Armenian and French	278

CHAPTER 8
FROM CURRICULAR CONTENT AND TEACHING MATERIALS TO
IDENTITY DEVELOPMENT

Introduction

The curricular guidelines approved by the Education Council embodied lessons and materials meant to instill in students a broad sense of knowledge. An abundance of these lessons prepared by teachers and school directors relied on textbooks specially designed for the Armenian schools. Throughout the later part of the nineteenth century textbook publication increased significantly helping to shape the content of the course outline. Relying on an extensive examination of textbooks from history, language, literature, religion, and the sciences, this chapter provides insight into these valuable educational materials. Instead of focusing on one or two textbooks in each subject, the purpose is to show the breadth of knowledge and how the curriculum laid a foundation for building a unified system reflecting the philosophical educational framework. Heavily influenced by the authors who shaped what was perceived as legitimate knowledge for the teacher and the learner, there are three distinguishable characteristics of these textbooks. First, they instilled in the learner knowledge of the Armenian nation - historical, cultural, religious, and territorial awareness. Second, this knowledge was locatable in a larger global context centered on modernization of the educational agenda. Third, religious texts supported the secularization process by moving away from purely biblical teachings to incorporate ethics and moral values.

A final element of this chapter focuses on the reinforcement of knowledge through the construction of an examination process. These assessments signified a 'rite of passage' for students and marked the stamp of approval given by the Education Council and the community. The award of diplomas and merit certificates marked an achieved end reiterating the attainment of intended learning objectives.

Regulating Textbooks

Ten years prior to the formal establishment of the Education Council, communal leaders adopted a plan encouraging the preparation and publication of textbooks.³⁹⁶ The efforts to increase the number of available textbooks intensified with the formal establishment of the Education Council. One half of the Council devoted its energies to the development of educational materials. The goal was to create at least one textbook for each subject. The Council quickly began to fulfill its mission.³⁹⁷ By 1864, the membership had already approved an Armenian history textbook written by Stepan P'ap'aziants.³⁹⁸ During the same year, a survey of textbooks revealed teaching materials already available for grammar, reading, letters, geography, arithmetic, logic, and science classes. Furthermore, textbooks for penmanship, religious history and Turkish were already under commission.³⁹⁹

³⁹⁶ *Daretsoyts*, 93-94.

³⁹⁷ *Dzrakir Ĕnthanur Ėrinats*.

³⁹⁸ S.B.B. P'ap'aziants, *Tasakirk' Azkayin Badmut'ian* (Bolis: H. Muhendisian, 1866, 3rd printing).

³⁹⁹ *Deghegakir Azkayin Usumnagan Khorhrtots*.

The Education Council signified its approval of a textbook by placing a label on the front cover or in the inner pages.⁴⁰⁰ Only these textbooks were supposed to be used in the schools in order to avoid "unwanted inspections" by the state.⁴⁰¹ There was some flexibility to this strict rule. The Council granted school trustees the authority to find suitable materials if teachers thought important information was missing from textbooks.⁴⁰² However, on several occasions teachers altogether circumvented these rules using unapproved textbooks in their classrooms.

Thirty years later a second textbook survey revealed the magnitude of growth and diversity. A catalogue of approved textbooks listed fourteen categories containing over one hundred textbooks. This inventory ranged from materials to support language learning - Armenian language and literature, Ottoman, French, and English - to religion and philosophy, mathematics, history, geography, economics, physical sciences, health, bookkeeping, and penmanship.⁴⁰³ Only a few textbooks from the pre-1880 period appeared in the catalogue. Instead the majority of the publications occurred in the late 1880's and early 1890's. There are two reasons to explain this sudden growth. First, many textbooks were written at a time when the number of schools and students began to increase. Second, earlier textbooks were often republished. For example, one of the most

⁴⁰⁰ Based on the Armenian Constitution, authority to approve textbooks devoted to spiritual matters was delegated to the Religious Council. The Mekhitarists whose schools were not controlled by the Armenian Patriarch also established their own system for approving textbooks.

⁴⁰¹ BNU 2/5.

⁴⁰² *Deghegagir Hamaraduut'ian K'aghak'agan Zhoghovots.*

⁴⁰³ The following is the breakdown of textbooks - religious studies (12), Armenian language and literature (35), Ottoman language (40), French language (9), English language (4), mathematics (13), history (8), geography (9), economics (4), philosophy (2), physical sciences (6), health (1), bookkeeping (1), and penmanship (2). *Tsutsag Kordzadzeli Tasakrots Hayots*, (1894). BNP Cote P.J.3.3, No. 19262.

sought after texts was *Azkayin Badmut'iun* (National History) written by Stepan P'ap'aziants. First printed in 1860 it was later reproduced in many subsequent editions. This growth in the number of texts and their content is an important concept in terms of nation building. These publications would provide an outlet for the dominant written language and a method of communication to promote national consciousness.⁴⁰⁴

An overwhelming majority of the textbooks were written in Armenian. A couple of publications did use Armenian letters with Ottoman words or a mixture of Armenian and French. Language textbooks were the primary exception. All of the texts for studying the Ottoman language were written in Ottoman. The same was true for French and English lessons. Although a couple of textbooks were published in Smyrna, Venice, and London, these were clear exceptions. The printing houses in Constantinople published a majority of the textbooks. Textbooks were advertised by publishers on the back of other books distributed by their printing house. In addition, some of the larger publishers also created textbook catalogues.⁴⁰⁵

Although educational materials were an important part of the school lessons, they were also expensive. Schools, particularly those in the provinces, often did not have the money to pay for these valuable resources. Frequently, students had to share their books with others and teachers had to make do without.⁴⁰⁶

⁴⁰⁴ Anderson, *Imagined Communities*, 37-46.

⁴⁰⁵ The goal of the Tavidian textbook publishers in Constantinople was to provide educational support. This was considered an official agency to guide academics and institutional directors in the organization of textbooks that followed stated guidelines.

⁴⁰⁶ *Deghegaker Hamaraduut'ian K'aghak'agan Zhoghovots.*

Textbook Format and Content

Textbooks published between the 1860's and 1915 were heavily influenced by the education and life experiences of the writers. Among the authors were prominent educators of the Ottoman Armenian community - R  t'eos Berberian, Hovhannes Hintlian, Madt'  os Mamutian, Krikor Markarian, and Madat'ia Karakashian.⁴⁰⁷ The most prolific writers were Madt  os Mamuian and Madat'ia Karakashian. Both produced Armenian language and literature textbooks. Karakashian, in addition to eight Armenian language and literature books, was the author of Armenian history, philosophy, and religious history textbooks.⁴⁰⁸

These authors often integrated their own background and training in the interpretation of materials. These visions of what the authors considered important concepts for the learner also exposed their personal biases in terms of pedagogical style and subject matter. For example, Kapamajian in his textbook on Armenian history focused the objectives of his work on understanding

the source of the nation, its organization, beginning years, fatherland, boundaries of the fatherland, the situation of the land, weather, climate, expansion, produce, commerce (trade), professions, culture, customs, character, description, domestic life, religion, ethics, rituals, prejudices, physical and moral superiorities or weakness, governmental manner, laws, classes, communications, politics, wars and their causes or product, and the source and causes of national sources.⁴⁰⁹

Clearly Kapamajian viewed history as a reflection of the political, cultural, and geographical boundaries. All of these components in his view were important parts of the

⁴⁰⁷ Hintlian (1866-1950) worked in several Ottoman Armenian schools and was an avid writer on education. He started the paper *Nor Tbrots  * with K. Malatian in 1909.

⁴⁰⁸ *Tsutsag Kordzadzeli*.

⁴⁰⁹ M. Kapamajian, *Tasakirk' Hay Azkayin Badmut'ian* (Bolis: Hovsepa Kavafian, 1879-80), 27.

nation. Therefore, history would include lessons highlighting the Armenians as an ancient and noble people with strong cultural traditions.

Textbooks were also important because they provided a format and structure for classroom lessons. The textbooks used by the Armenians contained four pedagogical styles. The earliest textbooks used primarily, but not exclusively, in the lower grades contained catechism lessons. These texts began with a question which was followed by an answer students were expected to internalize and memorize. The second type of textbook consisted of short stories followed by a general conclusion. Used in the middle level classes, these textbooks did allow students some measure of creativity and interpretation.

Meanwhile, textbooks for the upper grades advanced these earlier styles. In addition to stories with short passages, each chapter ended with a series of concluding questions. The presence of these questions encouraged students to develop their own interpretations of the lessons. Modernization and the introduction of new technologies in the twentieth century resulted in the integration of pictures into the textbooks. Furthermore, these more advanced works included suggestions for further reading and assignments for students at the end of chapter.⁴¹⁰

Armenian Language and History Textbooks

Memorializing and imagining the nation, the thematic construction of Armenian history, geography, and language textbooks reflect a framework closely aligned with the philosophical goals of the Education Council. Ancient history, territorial bonds, diaspora and dispersion all figured prominently in the interpretation of Armenian identity. Meanwhile, cultural history also played an important role within the confines of religious

⁴¹⁰ Prof. H. Hagopian, *Azkeru Badmut'iun - P. Hador* (Bolis: H. Madteosian, 1912).

discourse, educational institutions and communal leaders. These lessons served as a foundation for the popular depiction of the Armenian nation based on a clear logic of historic sentiment, territorial boundaries, and cultural unity.

Ancient History

Historical memory of an ancient people was an important part of the Armenian based textbooks. Most of the historical focal points were categorized based on general discussions of the dynastic periods. The general agreement among the ancient history texts was the focus on six principal periods - the Haigazian, Arshakuni, Gurabaghad and Vosdigan, Pakraduni, and Rupinian.⁴¹¹

The study of national history meant that knowledge of famous battles (e.g. the Vartanantz War with the Persians) and figures (e.g. Vartan Mamigonian), already considered important components popular memory, was strengthened as the result of textbook learning. History textbook also highlighted the role of Armenian rulers.⁴¹² For example Drtad II (A.D. 217-252), who ruled during a period when the Romans and Persians struggled to control Armenia, was considered a brave king for defending his people.

The placement of Armenia and the kingdom of Cilicia all served as general focal points of events with historical significance to the Armenians.⁴¹³ The city of Ani, established as a capital in the tenth century was memorialized for its beauty and numerous churches. Meanwhile, Sis under the reign of Levon II was considered a place where

⁴¹¹ S.B.B. P'ap'aziants, *Tasakirk' Azkayin Badmut'ian* (Bolis: Kavafian, 1874, 5th printing).

⁴¹² T. Khachgunts, *Badgerazart Hayots Badmut'ian Mich'in P* (Bolis: A.B. Yeazejian yev eng., 1910).

⁴¹³ *Ibid*; I.K. Aslanian, *Nor Ashkharhakrut'iun* (Bolis: Aramian, 1874).

Armenians would be protected from foreign invasions. Students came to recognize these cities as an important and integral part of Armenian greatness and political power.

However, the glories of Armenian heroes were also tempered by pain and suffering. This reflects the final component in the study of ancient history - the downfall of the Armenians later subjected to foreign rule after the fall of Cilicia.

These lessons focusing on the ancient past predominated the study of Armenian history. For the Ottoman government the subject was much less suspect than modern subjects. However, even lessons that identified the Armenians as an ancient people served an underlying purpose of strengthening student awareness of their nation. An integral part of communal socialization, was the uniform presentation of the past and agreement of subject matter. This uniform approach by the author's of these textbooks meant regardless of the city or village where a school was located, students would be exposed to common knowledge.

Nature

The logic of nation construction was equally reflected in the discourse of lessons surrounding nature and territorial bonding. History, language and geography textbooks stimulated the learner to identify with the territorial nation. This identification with the territory reflected important geographical boundaries, national landmarks, the recognition of cities, mountains, and rivers.⁴¹⁴ Students were also taught the old names for cities and provinces in order to understand geography for its important historical meanings.⁴¹⁵ They learned the divisions of the Armenian communities in the Ottoman Empire based on

⁴¹⁴ H.H. Beyejian, *Ēnt'atsk' K'aghak'agan Ashkharhakrut'ian A. Dari* (Bolis: Nshan G. Berberian, 1889, 2nd printing).

⁴¹⁵ P'ap'aziants, *Tasakirk*, 5th printing.

diocesan borders of responsibility outlined by the Patriarchate.⁴¹⁶ With few maps or pictorial images, students often used their imagination to interpret the lessons.

Geography lessons were also meant to have a practical purpose. Based on these teachings student would also learn populations for each city, what street they lived on and what type of fruit was available in the region.⁴¹⁷

In an abstract and emotional sense, nature also meant living on and bearing the fruits of the land. Most often reflected in language lessons, food and the different seasons were incorporated into short stories and poems. The most obvious example was a handwritten textbook used as a study guide for teaching Armenian language at Sanasarian. Contained in the book *Ughetsoyts Mayreni Lezvi Dzirakir* (Guide to the Mother Language; a programme) are numerous poems reflecting the presence of nature, the death and birth of seasons primarily winter (snow) and spring.⁴¹⁸

Identification with the land in a historical and emotional sense reflected the goal of understanding the nation. Drawing the learner's attention to the historical territory brought increased attention to the significance of national symbols, markers and boundaries. Emotional bonds - the smell, the air, the feel of the land and the mountains, strengthened this relationship. These natural surroundings became an important part of identity by creating a picture of what was home.

Diaspora

For those in the "homeland" not only did they recognize this great bond with the land but also the dispersion of a diaspora and territorial loss. At the time lessons did not

⁴¹⁶ Beyejian, *Ēnt'atsk' K'aghak'agan*, 9.

⁴¹⁷ *Ibid.*, 10.

⁴¹⁸ G. Mgrdch'ian, *Ughetsoyts Mayreni Lezvi Dzirakir*. GAT: San Fond, 768-78.

label the people as diasporans but rather Armenians living in other lands. The reason for the inclusion of this history into the lessons was first for students to recognize the reasons for dispersion. Second, to confirm the place of Armenians in relation to other nations and ethnic groups.⁴¹⁹

Students reflected on the status of Armenians as a diasporic people based on territorial divisions. The lessons focused on the division of Armenians among the boundaries of Persian, Russian and the Ottoman lands.⁴²⁰ Likewise, school lessons recognized the dynamics of the separate governance and organizational structures for each of the Armenian communities. Karakashian divided the Armenian refugees/immigrants into five divisions—Persia, Russia, Poland, India, and Ottoman state lands. Pasmachian's textbook also reflected a conscious awareness of Armenian migration outside of the region. Attention was drawn to a discussion of Armenian emigration to Poland, Hungary, Moldova (Romania), and India.⁴²¹

The common vision of dispersion reflected the vibrant cultural characteristics of these communities. It also highlighted the shared identity between those in the Ottoman region and Armenians in the diaspora. Hence, the lessons focused on the contributions of diaspora communities and individuals to the nation, especially with relation to the development of educational institutions. For example, textbooks acknowledged the wealth of Armenian merchants in India and the establishment of cultural institutions. Armenian history textbooks written by the Mekhitarists also listed among important

⁴¹⁹ Khachgunts, *Badgerazart Hayots*.

⁴²⁰ *Ibid.*

⁴²¹ S. Kapamajian, *Nor Badmut'iun Hayots Hama'ōd* (Bolis: K. Baghdadlian, 1900): 128; G.H. Pasmachian, *Nor Tasakirk' Hayots Badmut'ian P. Dari* (Bolis: Kradun B. Balents, 1913, 2nd printing); P'ap'aziants, *Tasakirk*. 5th printing.; A.M. Karakashian, *Badmut'iun Hayots* (Bolis: H. Kavafian, 1888, 2nd printing).

diasporan educational institutions the Mooradian school in Padua and the Rafayēlian school in Paris. The Mekhitarists started both of these institutions.⁴²² The message these lessons meant to convey was the influence of education not only in the Ottoman Armenian lands but also throughout the diaspora would help to strengthen Armenian identity.

These lessons also focused on the strong leadership qualities of individuals trained at the diasporan Armenian schools. Therefore, lessons about Lazarian Jemaran and the Nersisian school included information about the many graduates who had become famous authors, scientists, and national leaders.⁴²³ Through these lessons students learned about educated individuals who started the first Armenian paper, theater and also served as provincial teachers.⁴²⁴ The point was to take pride in the achievements of diasporan Armenians, to create an invisible solidarity and to understand important cultural symbols of each Armenian community.

Cultural History of the Ottoman Armenians

Knowledge, symbolism and an understanding of cultural organizations did not only focus on the diaspora. A major component of the Armenian textbooks consisted of lessons devoted to local cultural history and the contribution of individuals to the Ottoman Armenian community. In addition to Amira Harutiun Bezjian, the Dadian, Balian and Duzian families were singled out in the textbooks for their charitable contributions. Meanwhile, others were recognized for their intellectual contributions. Pasmachian's textbook includes a short biography of important figures from the historical

⁴²² P'ap'aziants, *Tasakirk*, 5th printing

⁴²³ Khachgunts, *Badgerazart Hayots*.

⁴²⁴ Ibid; P'ap'aziants, *Tasakirk*, 5th printing.

to the modern period. Writers, educators, and community leaders such as Khachadur Apovian, Garabed Shahnazarian, Mik'ayēl Nalbandian, Mgrdich' Bēshigt'ashlian, Nahabed Rūsinian, Step'anos Nazarian, Ghevont Alishan, Krikor Ōdian, Krikor Ardzruni, Rēt'eos Berberian, Raffi, and Tzerents are just some of those intellectuals legitimated by the community.⁴²⁵ For the students this list reflected not only the role of Ottoman Armenians but also individuals with direct links to the Armenian communities of Transcaucasia. The hope was students would relate to these famous individuals as communal leaders and would be influenced by their works.

Concentrating on cultural aspects of the local communities to a large extent meant the cultural achievements in Constantinople. For example, a catechism lesson in one of the geography textbooks asked:

Q: What is the condition of Armenian education in Turkey?

A: It has improved, principal provincial cities have primary, specialty and reformed schools, the society and Sahagian school in Erznga, Sanasarian in Garin and S. Vartanian in Aintab. Bolis is better than the provinces, every district has a primary school the secondary schools are Getronagan and Aghchgants Arvesdanotsn. The specialty schools that are well known are Bērbērian, Mēzburian, Kurkēnian, Dēr Sahagian, Mirijanian, and Meshdudijian.⁴²⁶

Reflected in this answer was the author's perception that the schools in Constantinople are better than in the provinces. Notice that there was no mention of the American

⁴²⁵ Pasmachian, *Nor Tasakirk'*. Nalbandian (1829-1866) was an author, publishing many works in the newspaper *Meghu* in Constantinople. His writings focused on reform and patriotism. Nalbandian and Nazarian (1812-1879) worked together to found the periodical *Hiwsisap'ayl* (1858,62, 1864). Alishan (1820-1901) was a well-known writer who produced most of his poems in classical Armenian. Raffi (c1835-88) wrote numerous short stories focusing on social injustices, moral corruption and other subjects based primarily in the setting of Iran and Tiflis. Taught by the Mekhitarists, Dzerents (1822-88) wrote novels based on Armenian history. See Bardakjian, *Reference Guide*, 137-39; 116-18; 144-48; 124-25.

⁴²⁶ Beyezian, *Ēnt'atsk' K'aghak'agan*, 198.

missionary colleges in this answer. In fact this was quite common. When the question of educational conditions among Armenians was raised there was barely a mention of the role of the Protestant missionaries. This suggests that these colleges were not categorized as "Armenian" and the desire was to draw attention to the success of the internal community.⁴²⁷

Education was not the only aspect of cultural history taught in the school lessons. Rather textbooks also mentioned the role of charities such as the Kalfayan orphanage, Sourp P'rgich Hospital in Constantinople and the Sourp Lusavorichi Hospital in Smyrna. This discussion reflects a basic principle of helping others in need. In addition to the attention given to individual responsibility, the ideological discourse also focused on the role of communal governing structures. Hence, lessons focused on the role district councils played in establishing and maintaining communal support structures.⁴²⁸

Through these cultural lessons, students in the provinces learned about life in Constantinople. Similarly, textbooks also provided an opportunity for those in Constantinople to learn about life for Armenians in the provinces. For example, one of the questions in Kapamajian's textbook asks: What are the conditions in the provinces? The answer given is "the conditions in the provinces are very sad because there is limited education however the hope is that the Miatsial Ęngerut'iun, Azkanver Hayuhyatz, and the Tbrotsaser Dignants would bring reforms to the local schools and give a new impulse to national education."⁴²⁹ However, some cultural institutions in the provinces – schools in Sepastia, Van, Agn and the Armash seminary - were looked upon with pride. Further lessons highlighting the role of Khrimian Hayrig in printing *Artsvi Vasburagan* (Eagle of

⁴²⁷ H.S.V. Dĕr Movsesian, *K'nnagan Badmut'iun Hayots Badgerazart* (Venedig: S. Ghzar, 1914).

⁴²⁸ Beyezian, *Ęnt'atsk' K'aghak'agan*.

⁴²⁹ Kapamajian, *Nor Badmut'iun*, 132.

Vasburagan) and the formation of societies reflected the expansion of Armenian cultural life outside of Constantinople.⁴³⁰

Religion

Religion was also integrated into Armenian history and geography textbooks. Karakashian in his lessons introduced students to church leaders. This included the various Armenian Patriarchs of Constantinople, Jerusalem, Cilicia and Aghtamar. The lessons also focus on the works of the Catholicos as the head of the Armenian church.⁴³¹ The presence of religion in the history textbooks was an important element because of the important role Christianity played as an embodiment of Armenian identity.

Teaching about the Armenian Church was often done in relation to other religions. Therefore, attention was drawn to the Monophysites, Muslims and Pagans.⁴³² Although the Armenian history textbooks do mention the role of the Mekhitarists and Catholics, the first time that Protestants appear is in 1910. The reference in this textbook is not with regard to religion but rather opening schools for poor children.

There were, however, differences in the historiography based on religious affiliation. For example, Ōrmanian suggests that the histories written by the Mekhitarists were incomplete. By mixing spiritual values and general history his premise was that the study of national history was written from a particular point of view.⁴³³ In effect this reflected the ideological biases to which all textbooks could be subject.

⁴³⁰ P'ap'aziants, *Tasakirk'*, 5th printing.; also detailed in Karakashian, *Badmut'iun Hayots*.

⁴³¹ Karakashian, *Badmut'iun Hayots*.

⁴³² Aslanian, *Nor Ashkharhakrut'iun*.

⁴³³ Ōrmanian, *The Church of Armenia*.

Modern History

A final aspect of Armenian lessons focused on contemporary historical and political issues. Many textbooks did not dare to deal with contemporary issues. It was difficult to get such textbooks approved and the authors were often required to justify the material before it was published.⁴³⁴ The traveler H.F.B. Lynch recalled during his journey how "the history of the Armenian church and nation is imparted under great difficulties and without the aid of books. These would be confiscated by the Censor."⁴³⁵ Therefore, instead of facing these daunting regulations modern history was often taught subversively or in the religion classes.

On many occasions earlier editions of a history textbook were reprinted in their original format without any updates. An example is P'ap'aziants' textbook on Armenian history. His text ended at the Armenian constitution even though it was repeatedly republished into the twentieth century. Where P'ap'aziants ended foreshadowed what would come in the future. He even mentioned that throughout the last period of history the Armenian nation was entering into a new struggle for life and progress under state trusteeship. It was this concern for the condition of Armenians in Turkey that was mentioned in later textbooks written by other authors.⁴³⁶

This shift between historical memory and current political issues meant that textbooks opened up a new chapter in the Armenian schools. Teaching modern Armenian politics meant the study of laws, communal governance and regional issues. Karakashian's and Pasmachian's textbooks began to address important political events related to the Armenian people. These included the National Constitution, the new

⁴³⁴ *Deghegaker Hamaraduut'ian K'aghak'agan Zhoghovots*, 9.

⁴³⁵ Lynch. *Armenia: Travels & Studies, Vol II*, 214.

⁴³⁶ Kapamajian, *Nor Badmut'iun*, 131.

Ottoman Constitution, the conditions of Armenians in Turkey, the Congress of Berlin and the Treaty of San Stefano.⁴³⁷ It was not until the twentieth century, after the demise of Abdul Hamid, that textbooks began to openly discuss the problems Armenians faced. For example, a textbook from 1911 discussed massacres that took place under Abdul Hamid and the resulting protests in European capitals.⁴³⁸ Another textbook also provided students with information about Armenian revolutionaries including the formation of the Hinchag party and the Armenian Fedayi's.⁴³⁹ The image portrayed in these later texts was one of Armenian suffering and the movement toward political organization.

The themes emerging from the Armenian history, geography and language textbooks reflected a desire to educate students about the rich cultural history. Building on historical memory, awareness of the natural surroundings and religion as a communal structure, the objective was for the students to identify important markers of tradition – the Armenians as a noble people, place names, and the role of the Church. However, on the same level students increasingly became aware of the problems the Armenians faced living under Ottoman rule. Students also learned to identify with the complexity of the Armenian people and their divisions. Based on these lessons, students were already being exposed to global issues.

Transnational Knowledge

Education for international understanding was a crucial element of the overall philosophy taught in the Ottoman Armenian schools. Textbooks went about achieving this goal, using one of three methods to introduce the concept to students. First, foreign

⁴³⁷ Pasmachian, *Nor Tasakirk'*; Karakashian, *Badmut'iun Hayots*.

⁴³⁸ Markarian, *Kaghakatsiagan*, 26-27.

⁴³⁹ Khachgunts, *Bazgerazart Hayots*.

concepts were gradually introduced in textbooks by using French or English words to explain a term for which there was no Armenian equivalent. A second method was the translation of English or French language textbooks directly into Armenian. For example, a political economy textbook was translated from French specifically to use for teaching law. In the introduction, the author claimed there was not a school or class of educated people in Europe without the knowledge contained in this book. Since many European schools used a similar textbook, the suggestion was if you want to be as advanced as the Europeans you should learn this subject.⁴⁴⁰ Sometimes European textbooks were used in the classroom without translations. This was true of two French language textbooks Belèze's *Livre de lecture* and F.J.C.'s *Grammaire Française* used at Sanasarian.⁴⁴¹

A third approach utilized for increasing global understanding was the introduction of historical, geographical and linguistic knowledge in class lessons. Educators felt teaching about international issues would benefit the community both intellectually and economically. Therefore, western knowledge was also expressed in world history and foreign language textbooks.⁴⁴²

European influence was also reflected in educational modernization. One textbook suggested alternatives to the traditional schools. Students were asked what do you find in a classroom? The answer provided was desks, pens, paper, books, pictures on the wall and ink. These objects were only just being introduced in a few of the Armenian schools. This same textbook also showed how to set up a classroom. This included

⁴⁴⁰ G.S. Utujian, *Sgzpunk' K'aghak'agan Dndesut'ian* (Bolis: Masis Lrakrots, 1873), 73.

⁴⁴¹ *Sanasarian Varzharan Garno Usumnagan Deghegagir 1891-92 yev 1892-93*.

⁴⁴² H.K. Palakashian, *Ashkharhakrut'iun Badgerazart* (Bolis: V. Minasian, 1903, 4th printing), Introduction to the 3rd printing.

clocks and desks looking out the windows.⁴⁴³ In this same textbook another lesson taught how to construct a classroom. Based on what they had learned, students were required to draw their classroom in notebooks.⁴⁴⁴ With the placement of windows, doors, and desks, students began to learn about architectural drawing. However, the point to be made is the encouragement given to the creation of new types of knowledge. For example, the western influence in educational formation, entered in a story about *Les écoles d'aujourd'hui* (The Schools of Today).⁴⁴⁵ The story contained in the French language textbook told students to

ask your parents about schools of the past, it was the poorest house in the villages, the aspects of the school were miserable, the room was small and somber the students were in bad air but today we have good schools and good teachers, there are large windows, the air and light are good everyone is happy they have atlases and books⁴⁴⁶

The main goal of this lesson was to help students understand that similar changes could be made to the condition of Armenian schools.

History

Historical analysis was understood not just for the sake of national knowledge but rather a broader global understanding. The intended purpose of world history textbooks was to extend knowledge from Europe to North America, Africa, and Asia. Similar to the Armenian textbooks, historical teachings encompassed political and social (cultural)

⁴⁴³ Ibid, 8.

⁴⁴⁴ Ibid.

⁴⁴⁵ For the prayer see, K.M. Merminian, *Grt'aran Franserēn Lezvi Gymnase de la langue Française Tbrotsi Kirk' A. Dari* (Bolis: M.Sareian, 1903), 10.

⁴⁴⁶ Kh. Simonian, *Kaghghierēn Lezvi* (Bolis: Nshan G. Berberian, 1886), 79-80.

issues including language, literature, and music.⁴⁴⁷ Lessons extended from ancient to modern times. Regional studies and lessons on ancient Roman and Greek history were understood as important elements in contextualizing ancient Armenian history.⁴⁴⁸ The Greeks figured prominently in the discussions as students spent an ample amount of time studying about ancient Greece and Greek mythology. Students also acquired knowledge of the Romans. Lessons encouraged students to learn about the Coliseum and the Pantheon, schools and universities of Rome. One assignment required pupils to create a picture of the condition of Roman villages.⁴⁴⁹

The study of European countries also played an important role in curricular content. Although Sanasarian was heavily influenced by the German tradition, in general it was the French who received the most attention in terms of historical teachings. Napoleon and French history graced the pages of many textbooks.⁴⁵⁰ Political conditions from England to Germany, Sweden, Norway, Spain, and the Balkans also entered into the discourse. So too did an understanding of the imperialist tendencies of these states. Lessons about Africa focused on the European influence of the French, English, Germans, and Spanish.

Lessons on the Americas were divided into North and South. Students learned about the Civil War, Abraham Lincoln and the end of slavery. The study of Asia included the influence of the British in India and the rejection by the Chinese of western

⁴⁴⁷ K. Markarian, *Hamařōd Zhamanagagits Badmut'iun (sgseal 1789 minchev 1904 Abril 14) Masn K* (Bolis: K. Baghdarlian, 1909).

⁴⁴⁸ *Hamařōd Tasakirk' Ĕnhanur Badmut'ian* (Venedig: Mkhitarian Dbaran, 1897).

⁴⁴⁹ Dzalian, *Hamařōd Badmut'iun*.

⁴⁵⁰ Markarian, *Hamařōd Zhamanagagits*.

assistance.⁴⁵¹ Another textbook, used in the fourth class of the primary school, included material on European and Asian Turkey, Egypt and other regions that formed the Ottoman Empire.⁴⁵² From these textbooks emerged a pictorial image of the world. Students combined geography with history as they learned about the continents. However, with few maps included in these textbooks, students were often asked to use their own imagination to create a picture of actual locale.⁴⁵³

This world understanding was enhanced by attention drawn to the role of famous individuals in the cultural history of each nation.⁴⁵⁴ Sculpting, architecture, painting, and music all centered on lessons about famous artists. Beethoven, Mendelssohn, Schubert, Verdi, and Rossini were depicted as important figures in the world of music. Likewise, European educators and philosophers such as Rousseau, Montesquieu, Voltaire and the French writers Victor Hugo, Lamartine, and Emile Zola were all revered as important characters in the European setting. French language textbooks also contained the writings of many of these famous authors. Although the French received the most attention, students also learned about the British poet Lord Byron, Charles Darwin, Germans, Italians and Russians (Pushkin and Lermontov).⁴⁵⁵ Scientific achievements rendered the contribution of Louis Pasteur as an important advancement in the field of medicine.

⁴⁵¹ Ibid.

⁴⁵² H.H. Beyejian, *Ēnt'atsk' K'aghak'agan Ashkharhakrut'ian A. Dari* (Bolis: Nshan G. Berberian, 1889, 2nd printing).

⁴⁵³ Markarian, *Hamařōd Zhamanagagits*.

⁴⁵⁴ Ibid.

⁴⁵⁵ Ibid.

Meanwhile, the invention of the steam train, the phonograph and the telephone also increased student awareness of modernization.⁴⁵⁶

Textbooks also introduced lessons focusing on religious differences. One author listed the four major followings of Christianity, Islam, Judaism and Pagans. Noticeably absent was detailed information about the various religions that followed the Christian tradition. Included in the description of each religious sect was a listing of the approximate number of followers. According to the textbook the Buddhists, with 500 million followers, and Brahmins were classified as pagans.⁴⁵⁷

Teaching about language usage constituted a final element of cultural knowledge. English was conveyed as an important trading language while Arabic was depicted as the "richest among the Asian languages" and French was portrayed as a smooth and cultural language used throughout the world.⁴⁵⁸ Although most of the attention focused on English and French, German, Russian and Chinese were given passing reference. Students also learned where these languages were spoken. Hence, students gained from these lessons an understanding of colonial history.

Languages

Foreign language instruction was an important part of the curriculum. French language textbooks appeared as early as 1816 when the Mekhitarists published *Hamařōd K'eraganut'iun Kaghhiagan Lezvi* (Concise French Grammar). Textbooks were also developed for learning English, French, German, Ottoman, Persian, and Arabic. The most elementary textbooks provided an introduction to the alphabet and grammar

⁴⁵⁶ Ibid.

⁴⁵⁷ Ibid.

⁴⁵⁸ Ibid.

instruction. Lessons gradually advanced to include sentences and questions such as “<Charlie, what is it that makes you so sweet,> said a loving mother, one day, to her little boy.”⁴⁵⁹ Increasing levels of expertise resulted in the need to produce more advanced texts. Therefore, new textbooks for the upper grades began to incorporate poetry and short stories. In these textbooks there was an apparent attempt to integrate the west with the local environment, although not always successfully. Some texts used Armenian names while others maintained English names to describe individuals. Similarly, French names were also used rather than the Armenian translation. Therefore, the Armenian name Bedros became Pierre or Peter.

Language textbooks were filled with a combination of historical teaching, business, moral stories, object lessons, proverbs, and grammar. Animals were often used to explain morality lessons which followed biblical meanings. ‘Thou shalt not steal’ and ‘loving thy brother’ were just two of the biblical stories that tried to promote the understanding of moral values in the students. Another story discussed conduct toward relatives and the family. In the words of the textbook “brothers and sisters, being brought up together; eating at the same table, playing at the same sports, and united by the love of one father and one mother, are always expected to love each other.”⁴⁶⁰ The role of parents, especially the mother as a protector and provider was consistently highlighted in the language texts. The following poems, the first from an English textbook and the second from a French textbook reflected the status and role of women both in a local and western perspective.

⁴⁵⁹ S.M. Kasabian, *Tbrots Ankglierēn Lezvi Shrchan A* (Bolis: H. Kavafian, 1887), 9.

⁴⁶⁰ *Ibid*, 37.

My Mother

Who fed me from her gentle breast,
And hushed me in her arms to rest,
and on my cheek sweet kisses pressed?

My Mother

When sleep forsook my own eye,
who was it sang sweet lullaby,
And rocked me that I should not cry?

My Mother

...

When thou art feeble, old and gray,
My healthy arm shall be thy stay,
And I will soothe thy pains away,

My Mother

And when I see thee hang thy head,
It will be my turn to watch thy bed,
And tears of sweet affection shed,

My Mother.⁴⁶¹

La Maman

Qui nous aime des a naissance?
Qui donne a notre frele enfance
Son doux, son premier alimen?
C'est la maman.

Bien avant nous qui donc s'eveille?
Bien apres nous quel ange veille,
Penche sur notre front dormant?
C'est la maman.

Aussi, qui devons-nous sans cesse
Benir pendant notre jeunesse,
Cherir jusqu'au dernier moment?
C'est la maman.⁴⁶²

Mme A. Tastu

Both of these poems focus on the role of the mother. They characterize the tenderness and care of the mother toward her child as well as love and affection. This theme of duty and family responsibility was also an integral part of the moral and philosophy textbooks.⁴⁶³

In addition to moral stories, foreign language texts taught students necessary commercial skills. One English language textbook taught students how to write recommendations, promissory notes, and answers to advertisements.⁴⁶⁴ Likewise these textbooks carried forth the work of historical understanding by intermingling knowledge of the past and cultural awareness with language. French textbooks incorporated historical facts about Napoleon Bonaparte, Sir Issac Newton, Confucius, and the

⁴⁶¹ Ibid, 22, 29, 35.

⁴⁶² Merminian, *Grt'aran Franserēn*, 28-29. Although this text contains grammatical and typographical errors, the form used here is reproduced directly from the textbook.

⁴⁶³ V. Dz. V. Shahlamian, *Paroyagan Grt'ut'iun* (Bolis: H. Madteosian, 1904).

⁴⁶⁴ Kasabian, *Tbrots Anghierēn*, 34, 44, 53.

geography of Africa.⁴⁶⁵

Language textbooks also made sure to raise student consciousness of the important writers of the time. Short stories by Victor Hugo and Lamartine graced the pages of French language textbooks. It was poems and short stories such as Lamartine's that advanced language lessons instilled in the students. Therefore, learning became not just grammar, reading and composition but also incorporated the study of geography, history, and morality. Moreover, it became an important element to understanding other civilizations.

Ottoman History & Language

Education for the purpose of local, regional and global awareness meant there was a grave need to publish textbooks on the history and language of the Ottoman Empire. In some instances Ottoman history and language was integrated into the general modern history and geography lessons.⁴⁶⁶ However, for more advanced knowledge new textbooks were written. The Ottoman language textbooks followed the lead of the other foreign language textbooks. Students learned short stories, grammar, words, methods of translation, and how to write letters.⁴⁶⁷

Given governmental requirements that Armenian schools teach Ottoman history, educators embarked on the publication of new subject textbooks.⁴⁶⁸ Instead of using already published textbooks in the Ottoman Turkish language, educators felt it was

⁴⁶⁵ Kh. Simonian, *Kaghghierēn Lezvi* (Bolis: Nshan G. Berberian, 1886); Merminian, *Gri'aran Franserēn*.

⁴⁶⁶ Dzalian, *Hamařōd Badmut'iun*.

⁴⁶⁷ M. Apigian, *Keghetsig Krvadz'k' ou Lēt'avfi Asar Masn P* (1912, 10th printing).

⁴⁶⁸ K. Markarian, *Badgerazart yev K'ardisavor Ōsmanian Badmut'iun* (Bolis: Osm. Kordzagtzagan Ĕngerut'iun, 1912).

important for students to learn from Armenian works.⁴⁶⁹ The most widely used Ottoman history textbook was Krikor Markarian's *Ösmanian Badmut'iun* (Ottoman History). First approved by the educational council in 1889 for use in the third and fourth class years, this book traced the rule of each Sultan.⁴⁷⁰ After the first printing the book was revised and republished in 1912 to include the reign of Abdul Hamid and the present conditions of the Armenian people.⁴⁷¹

In this depiction of modern history students learned lessons about the Tanzimat reforms and the relations between Ottomans and European powers.⁴⁷² Lessons on the Treaty of San Stefano and the articles of the Treaty of Berlin granting Armenians rights to their provincial areas were also incorporated in the Ottoman history textbooks.

Markarian's textbook also outlined the rise of Abdul Hamid II, the Ottoman Constitution of 1876 and the Russian War in 1877-1878. According to Markarian's treatise, Abdul Hamid was a despotic ruler. His thirty-three years of rule was the darkest period of Ottoman history as "life became intolerable especially in Bolis with massacres organized against the Armenians with more than 300,000 killed in Hayasdan."⁴⁷³ The lessons further described the Armenian massacres in 1895 and the financial loss of property, the Armenian occupation of the Ottoman Bank and then massacres again in 1896.⁴⁷⁴ The arrival of the Young Turks was treated with great joy. The lessons centered on the formation of Armenian political organizations portraying their need to relieve the

⁴⁶⁹ M. Ashjian, *Badmut'iun_Ösmanian* (Bolis: Zarkarian, 1886).

⁴⁷⁰ K. Markarian, *Hama'ōd Ösmanian Badmut'iun* (Bolis: Sareian, 1905).

⁴⁷¹ Markarian, *Badgerazart yev K'ardisavor*.

⁴⁷² Kapamajian, *Nor Badmut'iun Hayots*.

⁴⁷³ Markarian, *Badgerazart yev K'ardisavor*, 273.

⁴⁷⁴ Kapamajian, *Nor Badmut'iun Hayots*.

suffering of the Armenian people.⁴⁷⁵ Markarian's textbook also included maps detailing the boundaries of the Ottoman State. Over the centuries even with the expansion of the Ottoman Empire in Eastern Anatolia the maps included reference to Armenia.⁴⁷⁶

Students also studied the various ethnic populations living within the Ottoman territories. From Kurds, Arabs, Greeks, Avshar, Cherkes, to the Laz, Assyrians, Jews, Yezidis, and Chaldeans students learned about the other people who lived throughout the Ottoman Empire.⁴⁷⁷ History textbooks also included cultural lessons. Ottoman literature, the influence of western literature and the establishment of the theater were important aspects of these lessons.⁴⁷⁸ Armenians - such as the Duzian and Balian families - also entered into section of the Ottoman history textbooks which highlighted the contributions of various individuals to the Empire. Although these textbooks encouraged the Armenian students to develop a passive knowledge of Ottoman culture and history, it was clear much more attention should be given to the study of national (ie Armenian) history.

Science & Mathematics

Language, literature, and history textbooks were not the only subjects to inculcate knowledge for national benefit. Science and mathematics were also an important part of this curriculum bringing modernization and new ideas to the people. Some of the lessons used to teach these subjects actually served a dual purpose. For example, a text by Madt'ēos Mamurian used to teach basic reading skills also incorporated science and mathematics lessons. He stressed the need to recognize animal sounds, the different

⁴⁷⁵ Markarian, *Badgerazart yev K'ardisavor*, 275.

⁴⁷⁶ *Ibid*, 89, 163, 168.

⁴⁷⁷ Kapamajian, *Nor Badmut'iun Hayots*.

⁴⁷⁸ Markarian, *Badgerazart yev K'ardisavor*.

senses, types of jobs, and nature. Other stories focused on water, astronomy and temperatures. Students also learned about Benjamin Franklin as a poor boy who created important works because he wanted to study.

The stories of nature and history reinforced many gender stereotypes. For example, attention was drawn to a father cultivating the land so that the woman could have the ingredients to make bread. Another story taught about the danger of being out in a storm. This particular story told of a brother and sister who were out in the field. The sister was afraid of the clouds and wanted to go home because she saw lightning. However, her 'brave' brother told his young sister not to worry as they waited out the storm under a tree. Finally, when they returned home the father discussed lightning with the children.⁴⁷⁹

Specific textbooks were created for more advanced courses such as chemistry, physics, geometry and algebra.⁴⁸⁰ At Sanasarian these textbooks were German - Kiessling and Pfalz's *Wiederholungsbuch der Naturgeschichte, Traumueller Naturhistorischer Schulatlas* and Dorner's *Leitfaden der Physik* for natural sciences and physics; Foedter's *Anfangsgründe der Algebra*, Hentschel, *Aufgaben zum Zifferrechnen*, Lowe *Kaufmännisches Rechnen*, Mehler's *Elementarmathematik* and Schloemilch's *Logarithmen* in mathematics.⁴⁸¹ Although this might lead one to immediately believe only German texts were used, the reality was in many cases these texts were

⁴⁷⁹ M. Mamurian, *Ch'orrort Ĕnt'ertsaran Gam Kidelik' ou bardik' dghots badgerazart* (Smyrna: Mamurian, 1902, 8th printing).

⁴⁸⁰ Examples of these textbooks include: V.S. Hazarbedian, *Desagan yev kordznagan Yergrach'ap'ut'iun* (Bolis: Nshan Berberian, 1887); H.S. Khanjian, *T'vapanut'iun* (Bolis: V yev H. Dēr Nersesian, 1912); A. Nigoghosian, *Pnagan Kidut'iunk'* (Bolis: N. Berberian, 1909); S. Ferajajian, *Badgerazart Gentanagan Pnakhōsut'iun* (Bolis: Nshan Berberian, 1893).

⁴⁸¹ *Sanasarian Varzharan Garno Usumnagan Deghegakirk 1891-92 yev 1892-93.*

supplemented by works in Armenian. One teacher went so far as to create his own handwritten natural science textbook which included chemistry lessons.⁴⁸²

Textbooks were just one type of educational material used in science (and geography) classes. Physics and chemistry, particularly at Getronagan and Sanasarian, were taught in laboratories equipped with science equipment transported from the west, maps and globes. These materials served as symbols of educational influences from the west and the ongoing modernization.

Religion, Philosophy and Moral Values

Religious texts were some of the first books published for use in the Armenian schools. Most of these works were written by members of the clergy and focused on the Bible and Christianity. In the last part of the nineteenth century substantial changes were made to the religious curriculum. In 1897 the Education Council divided the religious curriculum into two branches. The first sector focused on religious study of the Armenian Church using books such as *Dareagan Ĕnt'atsk' Grōni Usman* (Yearly study of Religious Knowledge) and *Hamařōd Grōnakidut'iun* (A brief course on religion). The second half of the curriculum focused on ethics and moral values. Obviously heavily influenced by the development in moral education during the period of European Enlightenment, the textbooks reflected a general theme of social ethics and responsibility toward the family, society, the nation, the land, and religion.⁴⁸³

The initial lack of textbooks to use in the Armenian schools meant during the first few years an influx of translations, many from the French, served as materials for the

⁴⁸² *Usumn Pnagan Kidut'iants*. GAT: San Fond, 769-782.

⁴⁸³ J.L. Elias, *Moral Education: Secular and Religious* (Malabar, Florida: Robert E. Krieger Publishing Company, 1989).

middle and upper classes.⁴⁸⁴ The objective of the authors and translators of these textbooks was to instill lessons of moral teachings through religion, benevolence, love, politeness, customs, work ethic, and health. One of the authors even provided teaching guidelines for what he viewed as a textbook to be used not only for moral ethics courses but also in reading, Armenian language and world knowledge classes.⁴⁸⁵ He divided the text into a cycle of sixty-four classes and suggested the book be used over a two year period.

Religion was one component of the moral ethics and philosophy classes. Lessons in an 1882 textbook on philosophy included references to God. Likewise, the study of man and laws focused on the integration of the body, mind and spirit. Meanwhile lessons on the Bible provided religious guidance as well as taught the meaning of prayer.⁴⁸⁶ In one story students were taught about a boy who was worried by the fact his father did not pray. The young boy was frightened he would also turn out the same.⁴⁸⁷ A final element of religious lessons was the awareness of responsibilities toward the individual and the family.

A second theme focused on benevolence, responsibility and duty. Madt'ēos Mamurian's reader encouraged students, especially boys, to understand their responsibility toward God, parents, and friends. Moreover, he suggested by learning how to read and write students would be working toward fulfilling these responsibilities.⁴⁸⁸ Students were also told to stay away from personal vices of luxury, greediness,

⁴⁸⁴ S. Tavt'ian, *Hant'isaran Paroyakidut'ian* (Bolis: 1902).

⁴⁸⁵ Shahlamian, *Paroyagan*.

⁴⁸⁶ Abatsoytsk' *Jshmardut'ian* (Bolis: Aramian, 1882).

⁴⁸⁷ Shahlamian, *Paroyagan*.

⁴⁸⁸ Mamurian, *Ch'orrort Ēnt'ertsaran*.

drunkenness, and smoking. Instead the moral teachings were aimed at encouraging students to help others, both the poor and the sick. One story explained how a rich person who did not share his money was bad.⁴⁸⁹ Another tale reflected on a school friend who did not have books and wore old clothes because his father had died. The friend asked his own father to help this poor boy. The moral was that a student should learn to help others in need.⁴⁹⁰

Lessons also centered on the theme of love. In one of the books students were asked whom they loved. The response provided by the textbook was "I love my mother because she prepares delicious food and sweets. I love my father more because he brings money to buy sugar. I love my older brother because he brings me toys and he protects me when my mother wants to hit me."⁴⁹¹ This notion of familial love was an important part of the lessons. It also reflected the strong tradition of the family among the Armenians. Therefore, students learned not only at home but also in the school to respect elders and love relatives, brothers, and sisters.⁴⁹² According to the lessons teachers also deserved respect and obedience. Students could reflect this behavior by displaying good manners and opening the door for their teachers.⁴⁹³

Students also learned to love people for who they are and to be a good friend. In one story, a Persian played the role of a good friend. Another story reminded students to

⁴⁸⁹ Shahlamian, *Paroyagan*.

⁴⁹⁰ Ibid.

⁴⁹¹ Ibid, 41.

⁴⁹² Ibid; S. Karamajian, *Paregirt' Aghchig* (Bolis: H. Madteosian, 1900) (translated from French).

⁴⁹³ Karamajian, *Paregirt'*.

always tell the truth and not to take the "fall" for someone else.⁴⁹⁴ Textbooks for girls paid close attention to friendships and communication. According to the lessons a good girl was always polite to her friends.⁴⁹⁵ This meant not to be a hypocrite, to speak with honesty, not to lie and not to steal from friends.⁴⁹⁶

The treatment of friends was directly related to lessons on social customs. These customs required girls to behave properly in social situations. Girls were also taught to wait until spoken to and to set a good example for younger siblings. One of the textbooks teaching social customs was dedicated to the memory of Rĕt'eos Berberian's wife Zaruhi. The objective of this text was to provide spiritual knowledge and encourage the development of customs, politeness, and benevolence among young Armenian girls.⁴⁹⁷ This was just the beginning of lessons centered on the responsibilities of women within the domestic sphere. Working on needlework and linens by hand conveyed the message of important work.⁴⁹⁸ At one point the lessons mentioned how wonderful it was to enter the school and see all of the girls busy making linens. A young girl was also judged as good if she helped her mother wash the clothes.⁴⁹⁹ Similarly, the basic judgment was girls should make the home a pleasant place, maintain a happy spirit and fill the rooms with fresh flowers. Evidently, Berberian's wife exuded these important qualities. In a loving tribute he focused on her educational achievements and marveled at her ability to maintain a house and raise their five children. Zaruhi signified to Berberian the

⁴⁹⁴ Shahlamian, *Paroyagan*.

⁴⁹⁵ Karamajian, *Paregirt'*.

⁴⁹⁶ Shahlamian, *Paroyagan*.

⁴⁹⁷ Karamajian, *Paregirt'*.

⁴⁹⁸ Shahlamian, *Paroyagan*.

⁴⁹⁹ Karamajian, *Paregirt'*.

encompassing nature of these moral texts. Although Zaruhi was educated, she was not a school teacher in the official sense. Rather she did domestic work for the boarding school and took care of the essential needs of mothering. Included in this role of a mother was the role of an informal teacher for their children. Berberian concluded by praising the book as one that young girls could read to understand the many things that Zaruhi stood for. And, he also added that the boys would be thankful for this good work that guaranteed the future beautiful girls and mothers - Armenian girls would know the truth of goodness.⁵⁰⁰

Students were also taught to create a healthy work ethic. Laziness was seen as a bad quality to adopt. One story told of a boy instead of doing his lessons spent time playing with his little sister.⁵⁰¹ Yet another lesson about laziness focused on India. The story began by saying that "the inhabitants of India are usually lazy" and a European asked why one man was so active. The individual responded that from nature, the birds and animals he had learned to appreciate the need for activity and a disdain for laziness.⁵⁰²

Health and hygiene was the final theme of the moral textbooks. These were extremely important lessons given the constant threat of disease and that Armenian schools were frequently cited for their unhygienic conditions.⁵⁰³ Hence, students learned about the need for general cleanliness. At the end of one section was a summary of the

⁵⁰⁰ Ibid.

⁵⁰¹ Shahlamian, *Paroyagan*.

⁵⁰² Mamurian, *Ch'orrort Ĕnt'ertsaran*, 144-7.

⁵⁰³ Karakashian, *Sanasarian Varzharan*, VI, no. 5.

main points highlighting that a good girl was very clean and that it was shameful to be dirty.⁵⁰⁴

Religious and moral textbooks reflected in their teachings the ideological goals of the educational leaders to build a nation based on a set of principles and values. These textbooks along with the others used in the Armenian schools radiated the principle objectives of the educational philosophy. National foundations of historical awareness, intellectual growth, and moral values reflected the range and variety of textbooks and the content impressed upon the learners.

Examinations

Devised methods of examining students on their subject knowledge served as a culmination of school lessons. Initially the Council required students to take daily tests in addition to monthly and yearly exams. Marks ranging from worthless to the best were entered into the log book each month.⁵⁰⁵ This policy of constant examination eventually proved to be too much for teachers. Ten years after the policy was established, the Council changed the examinations to a quarterly schedule.⁵⁰⁶ However, even this method proved to be too cumbersome for teachers. Therefore, the schedule changed to yearly and half year examinations. At the same time the school year changed to a September to June calendar.

Under the new guidelines which called for written and oral examinations, only the written examination was given at the half year and both a written and oral at the year-end. The Education Council together with a committee of specialists prepared the thirty

⁵⁰⁴ Karamajian, *Paregirt'*.

⁵⁰⁵ 0 worthless; 1-3 weakest; 4-6 weak; 7-9 average; 10-12 good; 13-15 better; 16-18 excellent; 19-20 the best. See: *Ganonatrut' iun Ēnthanur Paregarkut'ian*.

⁵⁰⁶ *Deghegaker Azkayin Usumnagan Khorhrtots*.

question exams.⁵⁰⁷ Among the specialists were a school head or capable teacher and a member of the educational council or someone appointed by them. The examination schedule corresponded with the curricular outline. For example, in 1904 the yearly examinations included ethics, religion, modern Armenian grammar, classical Armenian, Ottoman, French, geography, physical science, scientific history, laws, and general history.⁵⁰⁸ However, according to the Council the most important subjects were Armenian, Turkish, French, and mathematics.

The month of June was a busy time for the Armenian schools. Students participated in written and oral examinations in front of their teachers and school trustees.⁵⁰⁹ Examinations were widely attended by communal and church leaders, education and religious council representatives, the district religious body, the district council, and other individuals invited by the trustees. The parents were also allowed to request an invitation.⁵¹⁰ The day also provided an opportunity for students to talk about institutional memories. In Erzerum the yearly examinations at Sanasarian turned into a holiday for the people of the city. At the ceremony one of the members of the management, usually Sarkis Soghigian, spoke to the students. The speech was filled with advice for the future. Meanwhile, leading clergy offered prayers and hopes for the school.⁵¹¹

⁵⁰⁷ *Gazmagan Ganonakir.*

⁵⁰⁸ BNU/Arch Patr Const DC 2/5 112-123; According to the examination schedule for the in Constantinople, in 1898 the schedule was divided based on the class year. By the time students reached the upper class they were being examined in Krapar, French, Ottoman, and Persian along with bookkeeping and sciences. GAT: Azadyan Fond, #1985.

⁵⁰⁹ *Deghegakir Hamaradiut'ian K'aghak'agan Zhoghovots.*

⁵¹⁰ *Bashdonakir, Ganonakir yev Haydakir; Hrahank Paregarkut'ian T'aghayin Varzharants Gosdanmubolso.*

⁵¹¹ *Hnkamia Deghegakir Sanasarian Varzharani.*

Diplomas

The official acknowledgment of educational achievement was awarded in the form of a graduation certificate. Educational systemization reflected the centralized nature of report cards and diplomas. Listed on the coeducational secondary school report card were all of the courses included in the general educational curriculum. Listed by subject matter were grades for language, religion, mathematics, science, history, singing, and exercise. Separate marks were also granted for Armenian reading, grammar, literature and history of Armenian literature. Likewise for historical knowledge students were graded separately for national (Armenian), Ottoman, and general history.⁵¹² Report cards at Getronagan were graded from one to ten (see appendix E).

There was a clear distinction between grade certificates and the graduation diploma. School diplomas underscored the relevance of Armenian, European and Ottoman influence in the educational system. For example, primary school certificates were written in French, Armenian and Ottoman (see appendix C). Changes made to diplomas reflected greater societal change, particularly the growing Turkish influence. New regulations required all certificates, such as one from 1913, be written in Ottoman (see appendix D).⁵¹³ In addition, provincial councils could no longer grant certificates.

The graduation certificate from the national school was granted by the educational council and signed by the Patriarch. Meanwhile, the diplomas from specialty schools such as Getronagan reflected institutional preferences. Getronagan's diplomas, granted by the trustees of the school, were written only in Armenian (see appendix F).

⁵¹² *Nerk'in Ganonakir*.

⁵¹³ The diplomas and certificates from the American missionary schools were also very different. Usually there diplomas were written in English. On one, from the American School for Girls in Erzurum, the top states, "sent ont thy light and thy truth", a clear mark of the Protestant influence (a note of thanks to Haig Manoogian for providing a copy of his mother's diploma).

Combining the Education Council guidelines with its own leanings, the Sanasarian diploma was written in Armenian, French and Turkish. The certificate listed where and when a student was born, how many years the student had been at the school and the date of graduation. It also listed the subjects for the school and the grade that the student received, stamped with an official school seal and signed by all three directors (see appendix G).

Conclusion

Materials used in the Armenian schools varied widely in subject matter and pedagogical style. Monitored by the Education Council, the lessons and knowledge conveyed by the use of textbooks sought to perpetuate a conscious understanding of Armenian historical memory and cultural traditions. In addition to the recognition of historic symbols, the textbooks had a broader educational purpose of cultivating awareness of larger global issues. This included the study of European political, cultural and social issues. Moral and religious texts also provided a clear pattern of socialization. However, what is apparent from these textbooks is that within the formal classroom students were exposed to only a passive knowledge of Ottoman history, laws, and language. This was enough to provide economic benefit to the Armenians through trade but distant enough so the people did not assimilate.

Authors of these textbooks played an integral role in the educational process. Each writer brought a different approach to the subject matter. They incorporated their own educational experience with interpretations of historical fact, moral philosophy, linguistics, and the sciences. In the end it was these educators who measured achievement through examinations. They also maintained a pivotal role in the approval of diplomas.